

**MATH 233 LECTURE 23:  
FINISHING UP DIFFERENTIAL MULTIVARIABLE CALCULUS**

This lecture ties up two loose ends:

- Clairaut's Theorem:  $f_{xy} = f_{yx}$  wherever the second partials are continuous.

Suppose they are continuous near  $(0, 0)$ .<sup>1</sup> We have

$$f_x(0, y) = \lim_{\Delta x \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(\Delta x, y) - f(0, y)}{\Delta x}$$

and so

$$\begin{aligned} f_{xy}(0, 0) &= \lim_{\Delta y \rightarrow 0} \frac{f_x(0, \Delta y) - f_x(0, 0)}{\Delta y} \\ &= \lim_{\Delta y \rightarrow 0} \frac{\left( \lim_{\Delta x \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(\Delta x, \Delta y) - f(0, \Delta y)}{\Delta x} \right) - \left( \lim_{\Delta x \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(\Delta x, 0) - f(0, 0)}{\Delta x} \right)}{\Delta y} \\ &= \lim_{\Delta y \rightarrow 0} \lim_{\Delta x \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(\Delta x, \Delta y) - f(\Delta x, 0) - f(0, \Delta y) + f(0, 0)}{\Delta x \Delta y}. \end{aligned}$$

By the same argument with  $x$  and  $y$  reversed,  $f_{yx}(0, 0)$  is the same as the last expression, but with  $\lim_{\Delta y \rightarrow 0}$  and  $\lim_{\Delta x \rightarrow 0}$  reversed.

Why could switching the order limits be a problem? Consider the limits  $\lim_{x \rightarrow 0} \lim_{y \rightarrow 0}$  and  $\lim_{y \rightarrow 0} \lim_{x \rightarrow 0}$  of  $\frac{x^2 - y^2}{x^2 + y^2}$ : the first is  $+1$ , the second  $-1$ . But of course, this is a badly behaved function.

Write  $\Delta(h) := f(h, h) - f(h, 0) - f(0, h) + f(0, 0)$ , and set  $g(x) := f(x, h) - f(x, 0)$ .

We have

$$\frac{\Delta(h)}{h} = \frac{g(h) - g(0)}{h}.$$

---

<sup>1</sup>There is no generality lost here: if you want to do this at  $(x_0, y_0)$ , we can always replace  $f(x, y)$  by  $f(x + x_0, y + y_0) =: F(x, y)$ .

By the Mean Value Theorem (for  $g$ ), this equals  $g'(a)$  for some  $a \in [0, h]$ , which equals  $f_x(a, h) - f_x(a, 0)$  by definition. Setting  $G(y) := f_x(a, y)$ , this says that

$$\frac{\Delta(h)}{h} = G(h) - G(0).$$

Using the Mean Value Theorem again (for  $G$ ),

$$\frac{\Delta(h)}{h^2} = \frac{G(h) - G(0)}{h} = G'(b) = f_{xy}(a, b)$$

for some  $b \in [0, h]$ . By continuity of  $f_{xy}$ , we therefore have

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{\Delta(h)}{h^2} = \lim_{(a,b) \rightarrow (0,0)} f_{xy}(a, b) = f_{xy}(0, 0).$$

An exactly symmetric argument (swapping  $x$  and  $y$ ) yields

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{\Delta(h)}{h^2} = f_{yx}(0, 0).$$

So  $f_{xy}(0, 0) = f_{yx}(0, 0)$ .

We also had postponed justifying

- Theorem 2:  $f$  is differentiable wherever  $f_x$  and  $f_y$  are continuous.

Suppose  $f_x$  and  $f_y$  are continuous about  $(0, 0)$ . We want to show that

$$\lim_{(x,y) \rightarrow (0,0)} \frac{f(x, y) - f(0, 0) - f_x(0, 0)x - f_y(0, 0)y}{\sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} = 0,$$

i.e. that  $f$  is differentiable at  $(0, 0)$ . By the Mean Value Theorem, there exist  $a \in [0, x]$  and  $b \in [0, y]$  so that

$$\begin{aligned} f(x, y) - f(0, 0) &= \{f(x, y) - f(0, y)\} + \{f(0, y) - f(0, 0)\} \\ &= f_x(a, y)x + f_y(0, b)y \\ &= f_x(0, 0)x + \{f_x(a, y) - f_x(0, 0)\}x + f_y(0, 0)y + \{f_y(0, b) - f_y(0, 0)\}y. \end{aligned}$$

Plugging this in above yields

$$\lim_{(x,y) \rightarrow (0,0)} \left\{ (f_x(a, y) - f_x(0, 0)) \frac{x}{\sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} + (f_y(0, b) - f_y(0, 0)) \frac{y}{\sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} \right\}.$$

Why is this zero? Consider

$$\lim_{(x,y) \rightarrow (0,0)} (f_x(a, y) - f_x(0, 0)) \frac{x}{\sqrt{x^2 + y^2}}.$$

By taking  $(a, y)$  close enough to  $(0, 0)$ , we can make  $f_x(a, y) - f_x(0, 0)$  as close to 0 as we like, since  $f_x(x, y)$  is continuous near  $(0, 0)$  by assumption and the limit forces  $a \rightarrow 0$ . Moreover,  $\sqrt{x^2 + y^2} \geq \sqrt{x^2} = |x|$ , and so

$$-1 \leq \frac{x}{\sqrt{x^2 + y^2}} \leq 1.$$

Applying the squeeze lemma to the product, and a similar argument to the other term, we get 0.